

**SPECIAL JOINT CITY COUNCIL AND PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
ESCANABA, MICHIGAN
September 8, 2016**

A meeting of the Escanaba Planning Commission was held on Thursday, September 8, 2016, at 6:00 p.m. in Room C101 at City Hall, 410 Ludington Street, Escanaba, MI 49829.

PRESENT: Mayor Marc Tall, Mayor Pro-Temp Ronald Beauchamp, Council Members Ralph Blasier, and Michael Sattem, Vice-Chairperson Kel Smyth, Commissioners Brian Black, Tom Warstler, James Hellerman, Christine Williams, Morley Diment, and Paul Caswell

ALSO PRESENT: City Manager James O'Toole, City Clerk Robert Richards, Executive Assistant Lisa Glish, Emma DeGan of CUPPAD, Contractor Robert Jacobson of HOL Limited Dividend Housing Association, LLC

ABSENT: Council Member Patricia Baribeau

Mayor Marc Tall called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

City Clerk Robert Richards conducted roll call.

APPROVAL/CORRECTION OF THE JULY 14, 2016 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

A motion was made by Commissioner Williams, seconded by Commissioner Warstler, to approve the July 14, 2016 Planning Commission meeting minutes as submitted. Ayes were unanimous.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

None.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

PUBLIC HEARING

1. Public Hearing – Community Master Plan.

Jim O'Toole stated that this part of the meeting was seeking approval from the Planning Committee, and that this will be brought in front of the City Council for their approval at the later date.

Jim O'Toole stated that Chapter 12: Plan Implementation has been updated, and the full DRAFT Master Plan has been distributed to all government and the public for review.

Jim O'Toole had the 6-minute Master Plan video that CUPPAD has created played for the all in attendance. He also explained that this video is overview of what the purpose of the Master Plan

is in a community and how it is mandated by the State of Michigan, and also how it is a necessary tool that must be in place in pursuit of any state funding.

Emma DeGad from CUPPAD stated that the Master Plan is now through the 63 day comment period, and now looking forward to adoption time.

Emma DeGad gave a brief definition of what a Master Plan is by stating, “It is a long term planning document that provides the framework for decision making and investing”.

Emma DeGad went on to explain how the Master Plan is formatted starting with an Overview of the History of Escanaba, and then it goes onto the Demographics all the way to Transportation. The Master Plan covers existing conditions in the City as well as issues and opportunities within the individual categories.

Emma DeGad then went on to explain the Public Participation part of the Master Plan, and how the input for that section was taken through workshops, public engagement meetings, and over 500 surveys that were completed.

Emma DeGad highlighted how Chapter 12: Plan Implementation looks back at all the previous sections and sets them into goals, objections and actions to those specific categories.

Emma DeGad went on to explain that the final chapter “Chapter 13: Future Land Use” identifies the framework for future land use and that framework is what carries into future zoning ordinances.

Emma DeGad stated that the Master Plan is also through the 60 day review period, and during that time only one suggestion for edit was submitted concerning a rewording of the wildlife: bird section.

Wildlife 6.6, page 48 Draft Language

The State of Michigan has about 420 bird species of migratory birds, with almost 400 species recorded in the Upper Peninsula and 300 in Delta County. The Great Lakes present a formidable challenge to birds navigating these huge inland seas and, as a result, many are forced to concentrate along the shoreline during migration. These stopover areas provide critical resources for birds to continue their journey north. An advantage of the City of Escanaba has in providing great stopover habitat is an incredible diversity of insects to fuel the migration. Ludington Park, Veteran's Park, and other City-owned lots along the waterfront provide habitat for migrating and resident birds. Common species include bald eagles, Caspian and common terns, gulls, ducks, and cranes. Additionally, the Upper Peninsula is one of the most northern regions that support Purple Martins.

In 2012, Escanaba Migratory Bird Enhancement Initiative (EMBEI) received donated plants, funds from the City, and a grant to enhance bird habitat by planting native species and installing nest boxes. In addition to bird species, a variety of amphibians can be found in shoreline areas, including leopard frogs, American toads, gray tree frogs and the eastern garter snake. Mammal species in the city include deer, raccoons, skunks, rabbits, muskrat, mink, and opossum.

Suggested edit by Joe Kaplan on August 24, 2016:

Of the 450 species of birds that have occurred in Michigan just over 400 have been recorded in the Upper Peninsula and nearly 300 species in Delta County. The large inland seas of the Great Lakes present a formidable challenge to birds navigating across the

continent and as a result many are forced to concentrate along the shoreline during migration. These stopover areas can provide critical resources for these birds to continue their long journey. Escanaba's coastal areas provide an abundance of emergent insects required to fuel the migration and Ludington Park, Veteran's Park, and other City-owned lots along the waterfront provide habitat for migrating and resident birds. In addition to well-known species such as Bald Eagle and Sandhill Crane the City's forests and marshes support a diversity of flycatchers, orioles, warblers, sparrows, bitterns, terns, and ducks. Additionally, Escanaba is one of last places in the Upper Peninsula that still supports breeding Purple Martins.

Since 2012, the Escanaba Migratory Bird Enhancement Initiative (EMBEI) partnership has received community support and grant money to enhance bird habitat in the City through the planting of native species, control of invasive species, and the placement of nest boxes for cavity nesting birds.

In addition to an abundance of birds, a variety of amphibians can be found in shoreline areas, including leopard frogs, American toads, gray tree frogs and the eastern garter and fox snakes. Mammal species in the city include deer, raccoons, skunks, rabbits, muskrat, mink, and opossum.

Jim O'Toole added that in Chapter 12 there are several objectives that were rolled over from the previous Master Plan, and new items have been added. He noted that what the City is striving to do on this plan implementation is to have action... creating a punchlist of items that will create more of a strategic element in the Plan.

Mayor Marc Tall opened the Public Hearing and asked if anyone in the audience had comments on the Draft Master Plan. After no one came forward he opened the floor up to anyone in the City Council or Planning Commission.

Christine Williams commented on the GIS maps pictures that are included in the Master Plan, and asked if the different colored layers on the maps will be cleaned up/lined up better, due to them looking a little offset. After a short discussion with Jim O'Toole it was decided that a disclaimer will be added to those pages where the maps seem to be slightly shifted.

James Hellerman asked if there have been any additional comments made from the public. Jim O'Tool replied that the City did not receive any, and Emma DeGad replied that CUPPAD also did not receive any.

Kel Smyth asked the Planning Commission if there were any additional comments or questions from the Planning Commission. None were given.

Marc Tall asked the City Council if there were any additional comments or questions from the Council. None were given.

A motion was made by Commissioner Christine Williams, seconded by Commissioner Tom Warstler to accept the draft 2016 Master Plan as presented with the feedback for Wildlife section 6.6, page 48. Rollcall vote was completed of Planning Commission members by Jim O'Toole. Ayes were unanimous.

Jim O'Toole noted that this item will be carried over to the October 6th, 2016 City Council Agenda.

NEW BUSINESS

1. Update/Approval – House of Ludington Rehabilitation Project and First Reading of Payment In Lieu of Taxes Ordinance No. 1174 and Municipal Services Agreement – LC Consultants, LLC.

Jim O'Toole reminded everyone that this project was final approved last year for funding, and it has gone through two (2) funding cycles, but was not funded through MISHDA. MISHDA does still have interest in the project and has been in communication with the owners of the property whom have retained a different developer for the project. The company/person that the property owners have retained is HOL Limited Dividend Housing Association, LLC. What is being sought out is to have the project remain the same as was previously approved, just change the developer on the project to HOL Limited Dividend Housing Association, LLC. The items that would need to be changed would be the Payment in Lieu of Taxes Ordinance and Municipal Services Agreement which would allow them to seek funding for the renovation and upgrading of the property.

Robert Jacobson from HOL Limited Dividend Housing Association, LLC approached the podium, introduced himself and showed a short slideshow presentation of renovated property projects that the company he works for has completed in the recent past.

Robert Jacobson went on to explain the process for funding from the date of his appointment to the application date. He went on saying that his company plans to submit the funding application to MISHDA on or before October 3, 2016 and then there will be a waiting period of around three (3) months before MISHDA replies with a decision to fund the project or not. If the funding gets awarded through the first application process, then groundbreaking for the project could be projected for around six (6) months after the award. If the funding does not go through with the first application, then the application will be resubmitted again until it does get funded.

Commissioner Morley Diment asked the question to Robert Jacobson as to how long, once this project is complete, does the building need to remain senior affordable living? Jacobson responded with it must remain for a minimum of 30 up to 45 years.

Commissioner Roy Webber asked what the rent for the housing would be based off of. A short discussion was held between Mayor Tall, Jim O'Toole, and Roy Webber explaining rent would be based off of moderate income of \$25,000 per year, and that the rent per tenant will be tied to the income level.

Commissioner Paul Caswell asked Robert Jacobson about how much local labor would be utilized for this project. Jacobson responded that the company intends to use as much local labor as possible on the project, and that it is not the goal to bring people up from downstate.

Mayor Marc Tall asked the audience if they had any thoughts or comments on the House of Ludington project.

Stephen Messimer, owner and resident of 208 1st Avenue South, noted that he believes this is a good plan. He still has concerns pertaining to vehicle parking and was wondering if there is any change concerning that. Jim O'Toole advised Mr. Messimer that MISHDA is requiring that they project be submitted with the current Marketing Plan (which supports the project) and the approved Site Plan as originally approved. No change will be made to the planned parking.

A motion was made by Council Member Ralph Peterson, seconded by Mayor Pro-Temp Ronald Beauchamp to set the Second Reading of Payment in Lieu of Taxes Ordinance No. 1174 and Municipal Services Agreement for the next City Council meeting to be held on September 15, 2016. Rollcall vote was completed of City Council members by City Clerk Robert Richards. Ayes were anonymous.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Peggy O'Connell thanked everyone for their efforts on the Master Plan. She also made a general announcement about the events that the Downtown Partners in Business hold, and that they will be looking for approval again next year to close certain streets to hold their events.

David Schwalbach, owner/resident at 212 1st Avenue South, asked Robert Jacobson if he would be willing to set up a meeting between himself and other surrounding Landowners to go over details of the project, and answer any questions they may have about the project. Jacobson agreed to the request.

COMMISSION/STAFF COMMENT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Tom Warsler made the comment that he was pleased to see that Robert Jacobson was present for the meeting.

Paul Caswell commented on how useful he felt the Dark Store video titled "Boxed-In" that was presented at Bay College. Jim O'Toole advised that he believed so also and that he would be presenting it his Manger's Call on September 15, 2016.

A short discussion was held between Ralph Blasier and Morley Deiment concerning the current condition of the Delta County Jail.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Mayor Pro-Temp Ronald Beauchamp, seconded by Council Member Michael Sattem, to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 6:58 p.m.

Kel Smyth, Vice Chairperson
Escanaba Planning Commission

James V. O'Toole, City Manager
City of Escanaba

Roy Webber, Secretary
Escanaba Planning Commission