City of Escanaba
Special Council Meeting
Monday, April 10, 2017

Pursuant to a meeting notice posted April 7, 2017, the Council of the City of Escanaba convened in special session in Room 101 of City Hall at 8:00 a.m., to begin the review and discussion of the proposed 2017/18 City Budget.

Present: Mayor Marc D. Tall, Council Members Patricia A. Baribeau, Ronald J. Beauchamp, Ralph B. Blasier, and Michael R. Sattem.

Absent: None

Also Present: City Manager James V. O’Toole, City Controller Becotte, and various City Department Heads, media and public.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT – None

Introduction by City Manager O’Toole and City Controller Becotte

CITY MANAGER’S PRELIMINARY BUDGET OVERVIEW – FY 2017-18

Pursuant to the Escanaba City Charter and relevant state laws, I hereby submit for City Council and community review the preliminary FY 2017-18 Budget. A copy of this document has been placed on file with the City Clerk and at the Escanaba Public Library, where the public may review it during normal hours of operation. An electronic version is also available on the City’s website, www.escanaba.org, and on the City of Escanaba’s Facebook page. This document serves as a daily guide for City Administration in receiving and allocating resources in the most effective way for the good of the community.

This budget, with over $31 million in expenditures, reflects our commitment in providing core services to our community and was developed using the best available information and most current revenue projections.
City Millage Rate/Tax Rate and Tax Roll. The preliminary budget is based on a property tax rate of 17 mills, which will not require any tax increase in the upcoming fiscal year.

For homeowners in the City, 40.7% of the total property tax bill is kept by the City of Escanaba to pay for all General Fund services provided. The remaining 59.3% of a homeowner’s tax bill is remitted to Delta County, the State of Michigan, the Escanaba School District, the Delta Schoolcraft Intermediate School District, the Delta County Sheriff Department, 911 Operations, the Delta Area Transit Authority, Community Action Agency and Bay College.

WHERE YOUR TAX DOLLAR GOES...

HOMEOWNER WITH HOMESTEAD EXEMPTION

City of Escanaba 40.7%

Delta County 18.9%  State Education and DATA Transit 15.8%  Escanaba Area Public Schools 11.0%  Bay de Noc Community College 7.9%  Delta Schoolcraft Intermediate School District 5.7%

NON-HOMESTEADED PROPERTY

Escanaba Area Public Schools 37.8%

City of Escanaba 28.5%  Delta County 13.2%  State Education and DATA Transit 11.0%  Bay de Noc Community College 5.5%  Delta Schoolcraft Intermediate School District 4.0%
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session

**General Fund.** The General Fund budget, which supports many of the day-to-day activities of the City, is $8,129,295 (including transfers in from other funds), representing an increase of 2.12% from the previous year's budget. At the end of FY 2015-16, the General Fund balance was $4,167,428, with a long-term debt obligation of $1,000,000. At the end of FY 2016-17, projections show an estimated fund balance of $4,332,094, with a long-term debt obligation of $875,000. In the FY 2017-18 Budget, a projected fund balance of $3,998,743, with a long-term debt obligation of $750,000, is being proposed. The budget includes an electric utility transfer of $765,796. Similar to most public utilities, this transfer, likened to property-like taxes or payments of lieu of taxes and the like have been made on an annual basis in Escanaba since 1956 so as to provide a direct benefit to the community including those properties that are exempt from paying property taxes. Using the latest available American Public Power Association data (2014) public power utilities contributed 5.6% of electric operating revenue back to the communities they serve. In early 2017, the City set aside $290,000 from the state personal property tax distribution rebate to be used towards rising pension costs. A transfer of $131,712 from those pooled pension smoothing funds is being recommended in the proposed budget.

As discussed with the City Council over the last several years, I, as do others, believe that local units of government are struggling because the State’s system for funding municipalities is broken and does not track with the economy. In Michigan, cities have very few sources of revenue—and those sources are shrinking. In recent years these sources have failed to keep up with the current level of services, much less rising costs. Also, Michigan law contains structural provisions that limit cities’ ability to collect taxes on existing properties.

Only once since FY 1998 have lawmakers acted to fully fund statutory revenue sharing payments (in FY 2001).
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session

What’s more, the cumulative amount of cuts to statutory revenue sharing for municipalities from FY 1998 to FY 2016 is estimated to be a staggering $5.538 billion. When counties are included, the cumulative cut to local government revenue sharing since 1998 exceeds $7.5 billion. Since 2002, Michigan has led the nation in cuts to municipalities. The Census of Governments, published every five years by the U.S. Census Bureau, reported that from 2002 to 2012, municipal revenue from state sources increased in 45 states and the average increase was 48.1 percent. In Michigan, municipal revenue from state sources declined 56.9 percent from 2002 to 2012. During this same period, total state revenue for Michigan increased by 29.3 percent(1).

(1) Great Lakes Economic Consulting – April 2016 – “Michigan’s Great Disinvestment”.

Unless this trend is reversed by the State lawmakers, the severity of the continued cuts in state shared revenues will continue to have a direct negative impact on the basic community services we are able to provide and communities like Escanaba will continue to be left behind because of the burdens of a broken system. Since 2002, the City of Escanaba has lost approximately $5,490,107 (2) in revenue shares.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Const. Payments</th>
<th>Statutory Payments</th>
<th>Total Payments</th>
<th>Full Statutory Payments</th>
<th>Statutory Reduction</th>
<th>Full Funding</th>
<th>Cumulative Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>$872,620.00</td>
<td>$857,054.00</td>
<td>$1,729,674.00</td>
<td>$1,618,892.00</td>
<td>$61,782.00</td>
<td>$1,791,712.00</td>
<td>($81,838.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>$863,338.00</td>
<td>$891,391.00</td>
<td>$1,754,729.00</td>
<td>$2,006,909.49</td>
<td>$217,518.49</td>
<td>$1,772,247.49</td>
<td>($279,366.49)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>$863,941.00</td>
<td>$653,841.00</td>
<td>$1,517,782.00</td>
<td>$930,600.02</td>
<td>$276,758.02</td>
<td>$1,814,541.02</td>
<td>($55,855.20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>$866,990.00</td>
<td>$621,682.00</td>
<td>$1,520,672.00</td>
<td>$946,443.39</td>
<td>$324,761.39</td>
<td>$1,845,433.39</td>
<td>($88,986.89)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>$880,310.00</td>
<td>$595,076.00</td>
<td>$1,475,386.00</td>
<td>$926,777.36</td>
<td>$331,701.36</td>
<td>$1,807,078.36</td>
<td>($1,212,578.27)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>$909,702.00</td>
<td>$585,684.00</td>
<td>$1,475,386.00</td>
<td>$907,720.82</td>
<td>$320,065.18</td>
<td>$1,857,422.82</td>
<td>($1,604,615.09)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>$857,958.00</td>
<td>$650,684.00</td>
<td>$1,508,642.00</td>
<td>$903,245.51</td>
<td>$337,561.51</td>
<td>$1,761,203.51</td>
<td>($942,176.80)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>$831,675.00</td>
<td>$434,512.00</td>
<td>$1,266,187.00</td>
<td>$975,575.15</td>
<td>$441,063.15</td>
<td>$1,707,265.15</td>
<td>($2,383,239.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>$847,051.00</td>
<td>$419,036.00</td>
<td>$1,266,087.00</td>
<td>$991,048.89</td>
<td>$472,708.89</td>
<td>$1,738,895.89</td>
<td>($2,855,948.64)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>$901,640.00</td>
<td>$294,759.00</td>
<td>$1,196,399.00</td>
<td>$949,233.27</td>
<td>$654,474.27</td>
<td>$1,850,737.27</td>
<td>($3,510,422.91)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>$920,305.00</td>
<td>$315,816.00</td>
<td>$1,236,121.00</td>
<td>$986,883.51</td>
<td>$653,067.51</td>
<td>$1,889,188.51</td>
<td>($4,163,490.41)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>$941,887.00</td>
<td>$331,026.00</td>
<td>$1,272,913.00</td>
<td>$991,604.72</td>
<td>$660,575.72</td>
<td>$1,930,480.72</td>
<td>($4,824,066.13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>$956,660.00</td>
<td>$314,137.00</td>
<td>$1,279,817.00</td>
<td>$1,007,178.57</td>
<td>$666,041.57</td>
<td>$1,963,689.57</td>
<td>($5,490,107.70)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(2) SaveMiCity.org – Revenue Sharing Searchable Data.

In addition to the losses incurred due to the broken revenue sharing system, the City continues to incur expenses related to Tax Tribunal “Dark Store” cases for such things as attorney and appraisal fees ($165,000 +/- to date) and refunds to property owners. There are currently 15 commercial cases pending before the tax tribunal with an aggregate contested taxable value of $7.1 million, which equates to $120,000 of annual tax revenue at risk.
Additionally, we are experiencing increasing revenue cuts on an annual basis due to the escalating number of Disabled Veteran Property Tax exemptions (projected to be $36,179 +/- in the upcoming fiscal year). Here again, without replacement funding for this type of cut, cities like Escanaba are finding it difficult to fund expected services.

Over the last decade, the City has made deep cuts which included the elimination of as many as 36 full-time City employee positions, the consolidation of departments and their management team, major changes to the City pension system and major changes to City/employee cost sharing in how medical insurance is paid for with the employee now paying 20% of the policy costs. Additionally, a change was negotiated in the five (5) collective bargaining agreements that changed the way vacation, personal days, sick leave and funeral leave are earned for newly hired employees in an attempt to control costs. This program also applies to newly hired non-union employees.

**Major/Local Street Funds.** Street improvement funding continues to be a major concern. Administration remains proactive in identifying funds to address shortfalls such as applying for competitive grants, however, this year paving from the Major Street Fund will be minimal due to a priority involving the need to reline the Butcher's Creek storm pipe at an estimated cost of $697,000. Major Street Fund expenditures, which support the day-to-day activities such as maintenance and snow plowing, are proposed to be $650,577. At the end of FY 2016-17, projections show an estimated fund balance of $2,494,355.

Additionally, the City of Escanaba maintains 55.05 miles of local streets. Local Street Fund expenditures, which support the day-to-day activities such as maintenance and snow plowing, are proposed to be $399,004. At the end of FY 2016-17, projections show an estimated fund balance of $1,085,034.

Each spring, the City Engineering Department conducts “Pavement Surface Evaluation and Rating (PASER)” inspections of all paved City streets. Using the PASER system, each street is scored a rating of 1 through 10 to evaluate the pavement surface condition. Each street is then entered into a condition category (poor, fair and good) and is assigned a treatment option. From that list, street projects are prioritized and selected based on surface condition, curbing condition, traffic volume, opinion of cost to repair and funds availability. Currently, approximately 65% of our street surfaces are considered to be substandard and in need of repair and upgrade.

As you know, late in 2015, the Governor signed into law nine (9) bills as part of his new transportation revenue package. We are seeing some revenue increases as a result but not to the extent the State was expecting. Administration will
continue to monitor the actions of the Michigan Legislature and Governor Rick Snyder on road funding initiatives to determine how street funding projections will be impacted either positively or negatively.

Major and Local Street Projects in the budget include:

**Planned Activity**
- Butcher’s Creek Storm System Pipe Repair
- General Street Paving – Local Streets
- Storm System Pipe Repair - 5th Avenue South and South Lincoln Road

**Amount**
- $697,000
- $150,000
- $25,000

**Electric Fund.** The Electric Fund budget, which supports the day-to-day activities of the electrical operation, is $13,297,040 representing an decrease of .56% from the previous year’s budget. As of June 30, 2016, the overall City Electric Fund net assets exceed $20.6 million. The current cash balance is approximately $13 million.

Of notable interest, the Electric Fund budget includes funding for:

**Planned Activity**
- Substation Improvement – North Shore Substation
- Distribution System – Power Pole Replacement
- West Side Substation Improvements (carry over)
- Street Lighting Fixture Replacement
- Ford River Underground Line Replacement (carry over)
- Distribution System Maintenance – System Wide Tree Trimming

A 1.75% electrical rate increase is included in the upcoming FY 2017-18 Budget.
Water Fund. The Water Fund budget, which supports the day-to-day activities of the Water Treatment Plant, is $2,449,812, representing an increase of 12.4% from the previous year's budget. As of June 30, 2016, the overall City Water Fund net assets exceed $6.8 million. The current cash balance is approximately $844,000.

Of notable interest, the Water Fund budget includes funding for:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Activity</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distribution System – Replacement Meters</td>
<td>$ 220,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant Improvement – Disinfection Byproduct System</td>
<td>$ 200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Professional Services and Assistance</td>
<td>$ 195,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Installation of two (2) Water Tower Mixer Systems (carry over)</td>
<td>$ 80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Hydrant Restoration and Painting</td>
<td>$ 42,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross Connection Control Program</td>
<td>$ 26,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leak Detection Testing</td>
<td>$ 20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrant Replacement</td>
<td>$ 20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leak Detection Testing Equipment</td>
<td>$ 4,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Due to the ever changing landscape at the statewide level concerning water safety, Administration is anticipating that the State will introduce new requirements on drinking water safety as a result of the Flint, Michigan water crisis. Without knowing what exactly those requirements will be, this budget attempts to address some of the scenario's that seem to be surfacing to the top. However, we do know regardless of what the State does or does not do we must continue to upgrade such things as our water meters as part of a water loss reduction initiative as well as finding and eliminating our continued loss of potable water within our distribution system.

In the proposed FY 2016-17 budget, a water rate increase of 8.4% is being proposed to meet departmental obligations and needs. With this increase, a typical residential customer using 60,000 gallons of water annually would experience a $28.32 annual increase beginning July 1, 2017.

---

**Cost of Water Per 60,000 Gallons Per Year**

- Marquette: $165.52
- Ironwood: $649.20
- Munising: $602.52
- Sault St. Marie: $540.00
- Marquette: $506.04
- Gladstone: $432.00
- Escanaba 8.4%: $385.52
- Escanaba: $397.20

Wastewater Fund. The Wastewater Fund budget, which supports the day-to-day activities of the Wastewater Treatment Plant, is $1,583,088, representing an increase of 6.5% from the previous year’s budget. As of June 30, 2016, the overall City Wastewater Fund net assets exceed $7.4 million. The current cash balance is approximately $2.9 million.
Of notable interest, the Wastewater Fund budget includes funding for:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Activity</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Avenue South – Lakeshore Dr. to South 15&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; St. – Sanitary Pipe Relining</td>
<td>$270,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grit Machine Replacement</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digester 1 &amp; 2 Refurbishment</td>
<td>$125,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Due to increases in operating costs, a wastewater rate increase of 8.9% is included in the budget to meet departmental obligations and needs. With this increase, a typical residential customer using 60,000 gallons of water annually would experience a $19.51 annual increase beginning July 1, 2016.

![Cost of Wastewater Per 60,000 Gallons Per Year](image)

**Solid Waste Collection.** No (0%) garbage/recycling collection rate increases are proposed in the upcoming FY 2017-18 Budget.

![Garbage Rate History](image)

**Motor Vehicle/Motorized Equipment.** Within the budget is a Motor Vehicle/Motorized Equipment Fund. The purpose of the fund is to pay for salaries, wages and operations required for the repair and replacement, purchase and operation of motor vehicle equipment and motorized equipment, and for the purchase of equipment, materials and supplies to be used.
in the administration and operation of the fund. This fund is primarily funded by each department under a rental and rate schedule for each unit in the fund.

The Motor Vehicle/Motorized Equipment budget is $988,987 representing a decrease of 1.3% over the current fiscal year. At the end of FY 2015-16, the Motor Vehicle/Motorized Equipment net asset balance was $313,132. At the end of FY 2016-17, projections show an estimated net asset balance of $350,117. In the FY 2017-18 Budget a projected net asset balance of $142,939 is being proposed. Because there are shortages in rental and replacement revenues from other funds such as the General Fund, we are simply not able to provide the revenue this fund needs under its current framework. Therefore, this fund will require a complete review, overhaul and reworking in the upcoming year so that it can be reconfigured to adequately fund sustainable dollars for future needs.

The budget includes the purchase or upgrade of the following piece of equipment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Activity</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department of Public Works – Automated Garbage/Recycle Truck</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Library Fund.**

The Library Fund budget, which supports the day-to-day activities of the Library, is $573,129. As of June 30, 2017, the Library Fund balance is projected to equal $70,092. The Escanaba Public Library is a community hub, offering essential early literacy programs for children and families, cultural enrichment and lifelong learning opportunities for all ages, and serving as a conduit to the technological resources and expertise citizens need to function in a digital world.

For FY 2017-18, the library will continue progress on implementing the partnerships and initiatives outlined in its strategic plan, with continued emphasis on strengthening sustainability. Library administration is currently working with the Library Board of Trustees to set goals, establish priorities, and create a work plan to move the library forward. The Library continues to build meaningful community connections that enable early literacy and after-school enrichment programs and is currently working with the regional library cooperative to expand digital learning through innovative outreach services. Funding to support these enhanced programs and services is provided by the Friends of the Escanaba Public Library and further developed through grants and partnerships with local and regional partners.

The City's General Fund appropriation for FY 2017-18 is proposed to remain the same at $400,000. General Fund support continues to be the primary funding source for the Escanaba Public Library and could be impacted in the future should the State not fix the current revenue system for funding municipalities. Also, the State needs to amend current laws related to how penal fines are distributed amongst public libraries so as to better level the playing field.
**Department of Public Safety.** The Escanaba Department of Public Safety was created in the mid-1970’s, at which time the police and fire departments were merged. In the budget, the Department of Public Safety represents 54.8% of the City’s General Fund appropriation. In dollars, this translates to $4,455,599 in the upcoming fiscal year. This figure does not include the costs associated with Dispatching Operations. In the 2016-17 fiscal year budget, the department had 30 sworn officers including Officers, Command Staff, Detectives, a Captain and the Director. In this proposed budget, the sworn officer head count is slated to increase to 31 including Officers, Command Staff, Detectives, a Captain and the Director. The funding for the increased sworn officer position will come from overtime savings within the department. With this addition, our sworn officer (all ranks) to citizen ratio will be approximately 1 to 406.

The current Director of the Department of Public Safety was promoted to the position on June 6, 2016 and is working on a fresh departmental assessment to determine if there is a potential and/or opportunity to restructure the department in effort to reduce overall departmental costs. In addition to completing a restructuring evaluation, the new Director has also been charged with the task of creating formal internal purchasing and expenditure controls and establishing specific and affordable minimum performance training standards for departmental personnel that meet appropriate national, state, and local standards and certifications in the most cost effective way. Lastly, the new Director was charged with the task of developing an overtime reduction plan in an effort to reduce those costs.

### PERFORMANCE MATTERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>PUBLIC SAFETY - CRIME, TRAFFIC, AND FIRE</strong></th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Violent Crimes Per 1,000</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>2.90</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>2.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property Crimes Per 1,000</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>35.3</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Injuries / Fatalities</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Tickets - City Infraction</td>
<td>593</td>
<td>773</td>
<td>783</td>
<td>652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Tickets - Misdemeanor</td>
<td>324</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Call Volume - Incident</td>
<td>7,600</td>
<td>7,512</td>
<td>8,455</td>
<td>8,408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Call Volume - Quick Call</td>
<td>13,803</td>
<td>14,557</td>
<td>15,527</td>
<td>15,680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escanaba Public Safety Case Clearance Rate</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statewide Case Clearance Rate (Averages)</td>
<td>34.1%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Municipal Marina Operations.** The Marina Fund accounts for the activities of the Escanaba Municipal Marina. The publicly-owned Marina has 165 slips, including areas used to boardside tie against the basin seawall. The Municipal Marina offers a full array of services, including seasonal slip rental, transient slip rental, fuel, pump out services, bath facilities, water and electric hook up and laundry equipment.

The Marina Fund budget is $244,102, representing a increase of 1.7% over the current fiscal year. At the end of FY 2015-16, the Marina Fund balance was $135,124, with a long-term debt obligation of $260,314. At the end of FY 2016-17, projections show an estimated fund balance of $97,000, with a long-term debt obligation of $246,318. In the FY 2017-18 budget, a projected fund balance of $70,000, with a long term debt obligation of $231,902 is being proposed.

No rate increases are included in the budget. However, the docks located within the Marina are reaching or have exceeded their recommended normal service life. To address these types of concerns, the Harbormaster was tasked with completing a debt restructuring plan which was done in late 2016. This was done so that the Harbormaster could put together a Capital Replacement, Repair and Improvement Plan for future upgrades. Once completed and accepted by the City Council, the implementation of the plan will likely result in the necessity to increase future rates.
**Downtown Development Authority Fund.** The Downtown Development Authority Fund budget, which supports the day-to-day activities of the Downtown Development Authority, is $332,120, representing a decrease of 30% from the previous year’s budget. The current cash balance is approximately $(329,700).

Of notable interest, the Downtown Development Authority budget includes funding for:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Activity</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Downtown Parking Lot Improvements</td>
<td>$25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Downtown Sidewalk and Curb Repair</td>
<td>$15,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDA Center Court Drainage and Repairs</td>
<td>$14,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session

**Escanaba Building Authority Fund.** The Escanaba Building Authority Fund budget, which supports the day-to-day activities and maintenance cost associated with the City Hall/Library Complex, is $324,358, representing a decrease of 2.9% from the previous year’s budget. The current cash balance is approximately $306,600. In the proposed budget $12,000 is being recommended to reseal and repaint the City Hall/Library Complex parking lot.

**Personnel and Staffing.** Full-time staffing levels in the budget include 116 employees. Part-time staffing levels are at 19 employees. Seasonal employee levels will fluctuate throughout the year, depending on the operational needs of the various departments. Routinely, City Administration examines all job vacancies closely to ensure that our human resources are aligned with our operational needs and our financial means. As previously discussed, the proposed budget includes the addition of one sworn public safety officer. The proposed budget also proposes the City of Escanaba entered into a professional services agreement with Delta County for Level 3 assessing duties. By doing this the General Fund is able to realize a substantial savings. Lastly, although the City Council approved the hiring of a part-time planning and zoning employee, this position is going to be re-absorbed back into the Community Preservation Department which in turn should realize a substantial savings to the General Fund. Retirements of key personnel in the current fiscal year and into the next fiscal year are of concern. Any further loss of employees without replacement will most likely disrupt City operations and adversely affect current service levels.

All five (5) Collective Bargaining Units have agreements in place until June 30, 2017. The negotiation process to renew will begin in April 2017.

**Health Insurance.** The budget takes into account a health premium increase of 5.1% as compared to 4.4% ~ 9.6% in the current fiscal year budget, depending on coverage, as a result of a contractual price increase from the Michigan Conference of Teamsters. In the budget, employee health insurance premium contributions will continue to be 20% of premium costs.

**Pension Obligations.** Over the last decade, the City has taken the necessary steps needed to address the unfunded pension obligations throughout the various pension plans. The City offers its non-public safety officer full-time employees hired prior to July 1, 2005 a defined benefit retirement pension through the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan (MERS). Based on the latest annual actuarial valuation report from MERS dated December 31, 2015, the City's plan is 59% funded, down from the 63% reported for the previous year. Employees full-time and part-time hired
July 1, 2005 or later are provided with a MERS defined contribution plan. Under this plan, the City contributes a mandatory 4% of wages and will match the employee up to an additional 3%. Public Safety officers hired prior to July 1, 2014 participate in the Act 345 pension. Based on the latest annual actuarial valuation report date June 30, 2015, the plan is 83.55% funded, up from the 84.03% reported the previous year. Public Safety officers hired July 1, 2015 or later are provided with a defined contribution plan through ICMA. Under this plan, the City contributes a mandatory 10% of wages and the employee contributes a mandatory 6% of wages with the option to contribute as much as they like. As a result of the pension plan changes and marketplace conditions, funding the closed out plans continues to be an increasingly larger percent of payroll and a general stress to the overall budget city-wide. The aforementioned defined benefits and defined contribution plans are the only post-retirement benefits offered to employees. Retiree health insurance is not offered and never has been therefore, no OPEB liability exists for that purpose.

**Master Fee Schedule.** Included with the budget is a “Master Fee Schedule” for services that are provided to City of Escanaba residents and non-residents alike. The intent is to have the fees reviewed annually by the City Council and adopted by resolution (unless otherwise mandated by State or Federal law) as part of the budget approval process. While the primary mission of government is to satisfy community needs, many City services solely benefit specific individuals or businesses and are subject to separate fees. As a matter of practice, the City will continue the policy of not subsidizing activities of private interest through general tax and utility rate revenues. Fees that do not recover the cost of providing the service result in a subsidy, which shifts away from other critical and high priority programs that may not have similar cost recovery options.

**Budget Schedule.** The budget has been developed with input from the City employees, City Council, City Boards, Commissions, and Committees and the public. This input is invaluable in terms of identifying the needs and desires of the community. The following schedule of reviews/actions has or will take place:

- **March 24, 2017** Council receives tentative copy of the City budgets.
- **April 10, 2017** Budget work session open to the public.
- **April 11, 2017** Budget work session open to the public.
- **April 12, 2017** Budget work session, if required, open to the public.
- **April 20, 2017** (Regular Council Meeting) Council passes resolution to set May 5th as the fourth Public Hearing on the 2017-18 City budgets.
- **April 21, 2017** Budgets are revised, based on the work sessions, and are made available to the public.
- **April 24, 2017** Publish notice of Public Hearings on budgets.
- **May 4, 2017** (Regular Council Meeting) Public Hearing on 2017-18 City budgets.
- **May 8, 2017** Publish notice of final hearing and adoption of 2017-18 City budgets. This notice must be at least 6 days prior to the budget adoption and must contain language to the effect that the tax rate will be a subject at this meeting, assuming that the City does not intend to roll back the millage by the base tax reduction fraction.

- **May 18, 2017** Public Hearing and adoption of City budgets. First reading of the Appropriations Ordinance, including the millage rate, and first reading of the Tax Levy Ordinance, with second reading and adoption set for the May 25th special meeting. First reading of Utility Ordinances, with second reading and adoption set for the Monday, June 5th special meeting.
- **May 25, 2017** (Special Council Meeting) Second reading and adoption of the Tax Levy Ordinance and the Appropriations Ordinance.
June 5, 2017  (Special Council Meeting) Second reading and adoption of the Utility Ordinances.

While it is my privilege to author this budget message, thanks must be given to the City Council, Department Heads, City employees, City Boards, Commission and Committee Members, and community members who committed themselves to assisting in this budget process. Collectively, as a team, I remain confident that we will continue to utilize our combined knowledge and experience in meeting the challenges that lay ahead in providing more efficient City services and growing the community economically. As City Manager, I appreciate and am fortunate to have a Council, community and dedicated employee support in providing the residents with the necessary resources, flexibility and funding which allows us all to live in a community that we can be proud of.

• No projected tax revenues projected;
• Discussed Dark Store issue and how it affected the proposed budget, and other commercial properties before the Tax Tribunal.

Electric Superintendent, Mike Furmanski – 8:14 a.m.

Mr. Furmanski reviewed the 2017/18 proposed City Electric Budget with Council. The following was discussed:

• Businesses closings and new businesses opening;
• Various Projects and their costs;
• Proposed rate increase of 1.75%;
• Fully staffed operations;
• Electric purchases projected to 2024, and reviewed 7 year plan;
• Provided an update on the Solar Farm project;
• Income, Expenditure, Capital Expenditure, and Operation Statements;
• Energy Optimization Program;
• Capacity purchases;
• Transmission and Distribution Statements
• Proposed changes in the fee schedule.

The time being 9:55 a.m., the Council recessed.

The Council came back into regular session at 9:03 a.m. and reviewed the following budgets.

Water/Wastewater Superintendent, Jeff Lampi – 9:03 a.m.

Mr. Lampi reviewed the following 2017/18 proposed Water/Wastewater budget items with Council:
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session

Water Department:
- Proposed projects and capital purchases and proposed budget increase;
- Proposed/Mandated State-wide water safety enhancements maintenance;
- Disinfection byproduct system and waste program;
- Cross connection back flow program;
- Water Quality Report;
- Plant Improvement projects;
- Production expenses;
- Proposed changes in the fee schedule.

WasteWater Department:
- Proposed projects, capital purchases and proposed budget increase;
- Sludge site program and proposed Ecomat program;
- SAW Grant Update;
- Reviewed Mains;
- Proposed Department Fee increases.

The time being 10:12 a.m., the Council recessed.

The Council came back into regular session at 10:20 a.m. and reviewed the following budgets.

Downtown Development Authority (DDA) – Edward Legault 10:20 a.m.

DDA Director Ed Legault reviewed the DDA Budget with Council and discussed the following budget line items:

- Proposed special projects, Façade Program, and Status of the Market Place Project;
- Revenue and Fund Balance;
- Proposed Capital Improvements
- 910 Ludington Street Building.

Public Safety Department, Robert LaMarche – 10:40 p.m.

Manager O'Toole and Public Safety Director LaMarche reviewed the following 2017/18 proposed budget items with Council:

- Provided a recap of the current budget year which included Staffing levels, overtime reduction plan, training needs obtained by Officers, Social Media programs, Angel Program and equipment purchases;
- Generator upgrade;
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session

- Possible grants;
- Act 302-Public Safety Training;
- UPSET and Forfeiture Programs;
- Dispatch Coordinator, and Dispatch Training
- Proposed Department Fee increases;
- Other Funds – Central Dispatch;
- Fireworks Law discussion.

Council consensus to break for lunch at 11:27 a.m.

Council came back into regular session at 12:00 p.m.

Public Works/Engineer, Bill Farrell – 12:00 p.m.

Public Works Director/City Engineer Bill Farrell reviewed budgets he was responsible for and the following 2017/18 proposed budget items with Council:

- Request for Celebration – Flags;
- Request for Cross Walks;
- Request for Care of Trees and Shrubs;
- Request for Sidewalks;
- General Fund Public Works and Engineering budgets;
- Sanitary Landfill, and Landfill Road Clean-up;
- Solid Waste Collection;
- Composting Activities;
- Request for Recycling;
- Snowplowing of Alleys;
- Request for Parks;
- Request for Historical Museum;
- Alley Paving/Maintenance;
- Other Funds – Motor Equipment and Equipment Fund;
- Reviewed proposed Major/Local Streets;
- Crack/Chip Seal road improvements;
- Request for Storm Sewer and Roadside Drains;
- Request for Sweeping and Flushing;
- Request for Traffic Service;
- Request for Snow Plowing and Snow Removal;
- Request for Ice Control;
- Request for Administrative and Engineering;
- Local Street Projects;
- Motor Vehicle and Equipment Fund and proposed purchases;
- Proposed fee schedule.
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session

Council consensus to break at 1:07 p.m.

Council came back into session at 1:16 p.m.

**Human Resources Director/City Treasurer, Robert Valentine – 1:16 p.m.**

Mr. Valentine, in accordance with Michigan Public Act 20, provided and reviewed with Council the annual Treasurer's Investment Summary, which included a review of annual investments, City portfolio, summary of gains and losses, and current listings of eligible depositories.

Blasier moved, Beauchamp seconded, to approve the acceptance of the City Treasurer's Annual Investment Report, Investment Policy Statement as of 12/31/2016, and list of depositories as required by Michigan Public Act 20.

Upon a call of the roll, the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Blasier, Beauchamp, Baribeau, Sattem, Tall
Nays: None

**MOTION CARRIED.**

Mr. Valentine reviewed the following 2017/18 proposed budget items with Council:

- MERS Pension status and obligations;
- Public Safety Pension status and obligations;
- All five Union contracts would expire June 30, 2017;
- Human Resources and Treasurer's Department Budgets.

**Reviewed Other Funds**

- Brownfield Fund Budget;
- Various Revolving Loan Funds;
- Farmers Home Grant will be depleted at the end of the next current year;
- Grants Fund;
- Housing Rehab Fund Budget;
- Land Development Fund Budget;
- Office Equipment Fund;
- Parking Maintenance Fund;
- Workers Compensation Fund.
General Funds

- City Council;
- City Manager Request;
- City Clerk;
- Request for Auditors;
- City Assessor – Contracted with the County;
- City Attorney;
- City Clerk;
- Board of Review;
- Request for City Hall and Grounds;
- Community Promotional;
- Request for Crossing Guards;
- Request for Planning/Zoning Commission;
- Request for Community Services;
- Request for City Band;
- Request for Tourism Promotion;
- Request for Bad Debts;

Hearing no further public comment and the time being 2:17 p.m., the Council recessed until 8:00 a.m., Tuesday, April 11, 2017.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert S. Richards, CMC
City Clerk

Approved: ______________________

Marc D. Tall, Mayor
City of Escanaba
Special Council Meeting
Tuesday, April 11, 2017

Pursuant to a meeting notice posted April 7, 2017, the Council of the City of Escanaba reconvened in special session in Room 101 of City Hall at 8:00 a.m., to continue the review and discussion of the proposed 2017/18 City Budget.

Present: Mayor Marc D. Tall, Council Members Patricia A. Baribeau, Ronald J. Beauchamp, Ralph B. Blasier, and Michael R. Sattem.

Absent: None

Also Present: City Manager James V. O'Toole, City Controller Becotte, and various City Department Heads.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT - None

The following Department Heads presented their budgets:

Library Director, Carolyn Stacey – 8:05 a.m.

Manager O'Toole and Library Director Stacey reviewed the 2017/18 proposed Library Budget with Council. The following was reviewed:

- Overview of the Department, Library Strategic Planning process, daily programs, services, and technology’s, and strategies the Library provides the community and Delta County;
- Outreach programs with the Communities and County.

Community Preservation, Blaine DeGrave – 8:15 a.m.

Zoning/Community Preservation Director Blaine DeGrave provided an overview of his department with Council.

Manager O'Toole reviewed the City Assessor Department, and Tax Tribunal cases.

Council recessed at 8:25 a.m.

Council came back into regular Session at 8:30 a.m.

Recreation, Kim Peterson – 8:30 a.m.

Recreation Director Peterson reviewed the following Recreational Department budgets she was responsible for with Council:
Provided an overview of Departmental activities and Civic Center Improvements; 
- Discussed possible grant projects; 
- Request for Civic Center, and Staffing; 
- Request for Fourth of July/New Year's Eve; 
- Request for Administration; 
- Request for Summer Sports; 
- Request for Wading Pool; 
- Request for Winter Sports; 
- Request for Beach, and Boat Launches; 
- Request for Civic Center Activities, and Discussed Building hours of operation; 
- Reviewed proposed fee schedule.

**Marina Fund - Larry Gravatt – 9:00 a.m.**

Mr. Gravatt reviewed the Marina Budget with Council and discussed the following items:

- Reviewed Marina Fund-Income Statement, Dock fees, services; 
- Reviewed Five-year capital plan for Dock repairs and maintenance. Possible funds available through the State Water Ways Fund; 
- Reviewed City Internal Loan; 
- Discussed condition of docks; 
- Discussed Fuel/Oil Sales.

Council recessed at 9:25 a.m.

Council came back into regular Session at 9:30 a.m.

**General Discussions:**

Council Members further discussed the following in the proposed 2017-18 Fiscal year budget:

- Building Authority Fund Budget; 
- Capital Improvement Plan; 
- GF-3 Rentals.

After discussion, Blasier moved, Beauchamp seconded, to change the Wastewater rate increase to 8.99 percent, and further transfer $54,000 from the Wastewater Fund balance to add the Wastewater Sanitary Lining project for Lake Shore Drive.

During discussion, it was Council consensus to make the following changes to the Proposed 2017/18 Fiscal Year Budget:
Annual 2017/18 Budget Work Session - continued

- Reduce Election Voting Machines line item from $10,000 to $1,000;
- Increase allocation for the July 4th Fireworks from $8,000 to $10,000;
- Transfer $150,000 from Land Dev Fund, to the Marina Fund for dock replacement;
- Transfer $150,000 from Local Street Fund to Local Streets for additional Local Streets repairs.

After further discussion, Beauchamp moved, Blasier seconded, to approve all changes to the Proposed 2017/18 Fiscal Year Budget.

Upon a call of the roll, the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Beauchamp, Blasier, Baribeau, Sattem, Tall
Nays: None

MOTION CARRIED.

Hearing no further business, no further public comment, and the time being 10:00 a.m., the Council adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert S. Richards, CMC
City Clerk

Approved: __________________________
Marc D. Tall, Mayor