

**MINUTES OF THE 2023 SESSION OF THE
BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW
CITY OF ESCANABA, MICHIGAN**

Tuesday Morning Session

10:00 a.m.

March 7, 2023

Pursuant to the statutes of the State of Michigan, the Board of Equalization and Review of the City of Escanaba, Michigan, convened in Room C101 of City Hall, 410 Ludington Street, on the above-named date for the purpose of organization and reviewing the assessment roll prepared for the City by the City Assessor for the year 2023, and/or any other items brought before the board.

Present: Board Members Mayor Mark Ammel, Jason Neumeier, and Judy Schroeder, City Assessor James McNeil, Assistant Assessor Crystal Martin and City Clerk Phil DeMay, Clerk of the Board.

Absent: Board Member Dennis Pearson

Mayor Ammel moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to excuse Pearson from the meeting.

City Clerk DeMay opened the meeting and called for nominations for the reorganization of the Board of Equalization and Review.

Nominations were called for Chairperson of the 2023 Board of Equalization and Review. Board Member Schroeder called for Board Member Pearson to serve as the 2023 Chairperson of the Board of Equalization and Review, and to close Nominations and cast a unanimous ballot for Board Member Pearson to serve as Chairperson for the 2023 Board of Equalization and Review. Ayes were unanimous for Board Member Pearson to serve as Chairperson for the 2023 Board of Equalization and Review.

Neumeier moved, Mayor Ammel seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to nominate Board Member Schroeder as the 2023 Vice Chairperson of the Board of Equalization and Review.

Mayor Ammel moved, Neumeier seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the December 13, 2022, Board of Equalization and Review Minutes as submitted.

Mayor Ammel moved, Neumeier seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the agenda as submitted.

It was the consensus of the Board to use approved Established Procedures for the 2023 Board of Equalization and Review.

City Assessor James McNeil also reviewed with the Board Members, the following:

- 2023 Assessment Roll & Changes.
- Discussed Work Study Schedule.

Mayor Ammel moved, Neumeier seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to recess until Monday, March 13, 2023, at 9:00 a.m.

Monday Morning Session

9:11 a.m.

March 13, 2022

Present: Mayor Ammel, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members Neumeier and Schroeder, City Assessor McNeil, Assistant Assessor Martin and City Clerk DeMay, Clerk of the Board.

Absent: None

Disabled Veterans Exemptions

Ammel moved, Schroeder seconded, to approve the following Disabled Veteran Exemption VE 01-78.

Ayes: Mayor Ammel, Schroeder, Pearson, Neumeier
Nays: None

MOTION CARRIED.

Ammel moved, Neumeier seconded, to deny the following Disabled Veteran Exemption VE 79.

Ayes: Mayor Ammel, Neumeier, Pearson, Schroeder
Nays: None

MOTION CARRIED.

1. Disabled Veterans Exemption Request

Appeal No.	Parcel ID	Name Applicant Name Owner	Filed Affidavit	Attached Proof	Surviving Spouse	Totally & Permanently Spec. Adapted	Unemployable	PRE %	2023 SEV	2023 Taxable	2023 Taxable Revised	Net Change	Reason
VE-1	010-2929-331-010	<u>Jeffrey Keller</u> Same	X	X	X			100	188,700	176,715	-	(176,715)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-2	010-2930-276-010	<u>Edward Stacey</u> Same	X	X	X			100	38,200	35,385	-	(35,385)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-3	010-2930-281-018	<u>Susan Dahm</u> Same	X	X	X			100	24,800	23,415	-	(23,415)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-4	010-2930-480-002	<u>William Rowley</u> Same	X	X	X			100	30,500	21,792	-	(21,792)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-5	010-2930-482-005	<u>Bruce Nail</u> Same	X	X	X			100	53,100	48,483	-	(48,483)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-6	020-3606-155-009	<u>Natalie Simmons</u> Same	X	X	X			100	124,500	110,525	-	(110,525)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-7	020-3606-156-011	<u>William Cook</u> <u>William F & Susan M Cook</u>	X	X	X		X	100	116,800	93,399	-	(93,399)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-8	030-2931-457-008	<u>Christopher Gouin</u> Same	X	X	X		X	100	52,000	41,027	-	(41,027)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-9	060-2931-409-008	<u>Lee Bruff Junior</u> Same	X	X	X			100	79,200	60,323	-	(60,323)	Approved 03/13/2023

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

VE-10	060-2931-426-006	<u>Carol Villeneuve</u> Same	X	X	X		100	53,000	47,355	-	(47,355)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-11	080-2930-355-002	<u>David Branstrom</u> David & Jeanne Branstrom	X	X	X		100	71,800	64,812	-	(64,812)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-12	090-2931-141-002	<u>Paul Drefs</u> Paul & Dorothy Drefs	X	X	X		100	53,700	47,941	-	(47,941)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-13	090-2931-142-001	<u>Michael Riegel</u> Same	X	X	X		100	60,500	53,581	-	(53,581)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-14	090-2931-181-001	<u>Mathew Witte</u> Mathew & Nicole Witte	X	X	X		100	64,200	56,537	-	(56,537)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-15	090-2931-181-005	<u>James Willette</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	55,300	49,459	-	(49,459)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-16	090-2931-183-003	<u>Robert Pearson</u> Robert & Kathryn Pearson	X	X	X	X	100	57,500	51,954	-	(51,954)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-17	090-2931-193-001	<u>Ruth Vinette</u> Same	X	X	X		100	114,000	69,592	-	(69,592)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-18	100-2931-212-013	<u>Chad Irving</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	66,600	55,847	-	(55,847)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-19	100-2931-226-011	<u>Jason Steinecke</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	54,400	51,400	-	(51,400)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-20	100-2931-260-003	<u>David Wilson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	77,200	54,439	-	(54,439)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-21	100-2931-261-002	<u>Paul Grimes</u> Paul W & Adele J Grimes	X	X	X	X	100	49,100	36,288	-	(36,288)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-22	100-2931-261-008	<u>Michael Segorski</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	74,700	57,753	-	(57,753)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-23	100-2931-280-003	<u>Ann Fix</u> Same	X	X	X		100	102,900	63,310	-	(63,310)	Approved 03/13/2023

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

VE-24	120-2930-306-008	<u>Deborah Johnson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	42,900	40,348	-	(40,348)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-25	120-2930-307-016	<u>Richard LaChapelle</u> <u>Richard & Mary LaChapelle</u>	X	X	X	X	100	43,300	38,887	-	(38,887)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-26	130-2930-104-016	<u>Richard Norby</u> Same	X	X		X	100	48,500	40,787	-	(40,787)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-27	130-2930-130-008	<u>David Johnson</u> <u>David & Sherrie Johnson</u>	X	X		X	100	41,900	33,409	-	(33,409)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-28	140-2931-403-014	<u>William Johnson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	126,800	85,121	-	(85,121)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-29	150-2931-104-004	<u>Debra Marie Carr</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	81,500	74,025	-	(74,025)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-30	155-2931-300-009	<u>Judde Snyder</u> Same	X	X	X		100	219,900	168,382	-	(168,382)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-31	180-2931-378-002	<u>Jeff Sierpien</u> Same	X	X	X		100	104,100	90,350	-	(90,350)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-32	180-2931-379-012	<u>Anthony Otero</u> Same	X	X	X		100	89,200	72,196	-	(72,196)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-33	180-2931-379-016	<u>David Hill</u> Same	X	X	X		100	57,100	41,029	-	(41,029)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-34	190-2930-153-001	<u>James Lee Pearson</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	65,600	59,220	-	(59,220)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-35	200-3606-177-003	<u>Albert Tobey Jr</u> Same	X	X		X	100	75,000	64,210	-	(64,210)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-36	200-3606-185-004	<u>David Pechawer</u> Same	X	X	X		100	111,600	91,027	-	(91,027)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-37	210-3606-302-011	<u>Ralph Johnson</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	63,800	51,201	-	(51,201)	Approved 03/13/2023

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

VE-38	210-3606-303-007	<u>Dale Stannard</u> Same	X	X	X		100	62,500	49,742	-	(49,742)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-39	260-2919-334-011	<u>Lynne Magnuson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	34,100	24,717	-	(24,717)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-40	270-2919-376-008	<u>Jay Krummich Jr</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	37,600	36,750	-	(36,750)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-41	280-2825-430-011	<u>Richard DuBord</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	84,800	67,681	-	(67,681)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-42	300-3606-156-007	<u>Dennis Grall</u> Same	X	X	X		100	90,200	69,592	-	(69,592)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-43	310-2919-352-001	<u>William Gouin</u> <u>William & Vivian Gouin</u>	X	X	X		100	64,500	55,874	-	(55,874)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-44	320-2930-252-004	<u>Janet LaMarch</u> Same	X	X	X		100	40,100	36,645	-	(36,645)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-45	320-2930-258-006	<u>Sandra Doran</u> Same	X	X	X		100	40,000	27,535	-	(27,535)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-46	320-2930-410-003	<u>Larry Naftzger</u> Same	X	X	X		100	76,100	68,441	-	(68,441)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-47	320-2930-414-001	<u>Charles Deaver</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	46,000	41,758	-	(41,758)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-48	320-2930-452-015	<u>Craig Barnhart</u> Same	X	X	X		100	51,900	45,387	-	(45,387)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-49	320-2930-457-015	<u>Richard Dagenais</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	42,800	35,302	-	(35,302)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-50	330-3606-127-009	<u>Gerry Rivard</u> <u>Gerald & Susan Rivard</u>	X	X	X	X	100	111,600	87,302	-	(87,302)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-51	340-2930-381-001	<u>William Worth Jr</u> Same	X	X	X		100	50,900	44,716	-	(44,716)	Approved 03/13/2023

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

VE-52	340-2930-383-007	<u>Jeanne Woodbury</u> Same	X	X	X		100	39,000	30,573	-	(30,573)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-53	350-2930-336-007	<u>James Doran</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	45,700	35,208	-	(35,208)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-54	370-2919-104-012	<u>Brent Papineau</u> Same	X	X	X		100	42,400	35,380	-	(35,380)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-55	370-2919-129-006	<u>Theresa M Akerley</u> <u>WM & Theresa Akerley</u>	X	X	X		100	27,400	13,621	-	(13,621)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-56	370-2919-130-009	<u>Richard Henderson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	26,700	23,859	-	(23,859)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-57	370-2919-132-006	<u>Ryan Michael LaForest</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	29,000	20,787	-	(20,787)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-58	370-2919-153-012	<u>John Izzi</u> Same	X	X	X		100	28,100	25,663	-	(25,663)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-59	370-2919-158-003	<u>John Griffith</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	45,200	42,000	-	(42,000)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-60	370-2919-158-004	<u>Betty Varney</u> Same	X	X	X		100	48,200	47,073	-	(47,073)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-61	370-2919-160-015	<u>Nelson Larson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	42,500	39,371	-	(39,371)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-62	370-2919-181-012	<u>Susan Searle</u> Same	X	X	X		100	48,500	40,669	-	(40,669)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-63	370-2919-186-001	<u>Jamie Dahl</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	42,800	36,262	-	(36,262)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-64	370-2919-252-007	<u>Robert VanEffen</u> Same	X	X	X		100	63,300	48,857	-	(48,857)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-65	380-3606-101-004	<u>Dan Mosier</u> Same	X	X	X	X	100	84,400	60,440	-	(60,440)	Approved 03/13/2023

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

VE-66	420-2825-300-017	<u>Katherine Hanson</u> Same	X	X	X		100	156,600	134,212	-	(134,212)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-67	420-2836-100-010	<u>Thomas Lancour</u> Same	X	X		X	100	71,700	62,469	-	(62,469)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-68	420-2836-100-039	<u>John Duncan</u> <u>John & Christine Duncan</u>	X	X		X	100	94,800	80,727	-	(80,727)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-69	420-2836-100-077	<u>Arne Anderson</u> <u>Arne A & Donna Anderson</u>	X	X	X	X	100	74,100	65,879	-	(65,879)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-70	420-2836-200-030	<u>Howard DeGrand</u> Same	X	X		X	100	112,600	94,365	-	(94,365)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-71	420-2836-200-058	<u>Joseph DeChristopher</u> Same	X	X		X	100	50,100	31,685	-	(31,685)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-72	420-2836-300-012	<u>Bruce Nelson</u> Same	X	X		X	100	52,800	42,488	-	(42,488)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-73	420-2836-300-017	<u>Joel Evert Olson</u> Same	X	X		X	100	51,100	43,772	-	(43,772)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-74	420-3501-400-020	<u>Jerry Young</u> Same	X	X		X	100	81,700	60,159	-	(60,159)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-75	424-0000-700-166	<u>Beverly Bunno</u> Same	X	X	X		100	2,000	1,670	-	(1,670)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-76	426-0000-750-142	<u>Randy Gillespie</u> Same	X	X		X	100	8,100	7,291	-	(7,291)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-77	100-2931-212-002	<u>James Bourdeau</u> Same	X	X		X	0	41,200	37,094	-	(37,094)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-78	100-2931-233-009	<u>Richard Lopez</u> Same	X	X		X	100	71,500	64,785	-	(64,785)	Approved 03/13/2023
VE-79	100-2931-237-007	<u>Jeanne Thill</u> Same	X	X	X		100	101,200	88,723	88,723	-	DENIED 03/13/2023
		subtotal						5,246,700	4,328,048	88,723	(4,239,325)	

2. Poverty Exemption

Appeal No.	Parcel No.	Name Applicant Name Owner	2023 SEV	2023 Taxable	2023 Revised Taxable	Net Change	Reason
PE-1	320-2930-456-013	<u>Cheryl Corbiere</u> Same	32,200	29,921	-	(29,921)	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried Approved
PE-2	370-2919-151-003	<u>Christine Launderville</u> Same	22,700	19,518	-	(19,518)	Schroeder, Ammel, Carried Approved
PE-3	130-2930-130-010	<u>James Kern</u> <u>James & Marilyn Kern</u>	23,400	21,557	-	(21,557)	Ammel, Schroeder, Carried Approved
PE-4	390-2919-383-010	<u>Donna Carlson</u> Same	34,700	32,947	-	(32,947)	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried Approved
PE-5	370-2919-177-015	<u>Clara Viau</u> Same	48,800	43,135	-	(43,135)	Neumeier, Ammel, Carried Approved
PE-6	010-2930-479-014	<u>Joseph Homernik</u> Same	20,300	14,053	-	(14,083)	Schroeder, Neumeier, Carried Approved
PE-7	320-2930-257-002	<u>Jacqueline Gerdeen</u> Same	32,800	30,555	-	(30,555)	Neumeier, Ammel, Carried Approved
PE-8	420-2836-200-008	<u>Joseph Robitaille</u> Same	63,100	55,100	55,100	-	DENIED – Ammel, Neumeier Carried DOES NOT QUALIFY – OVER INCOME LIMIT
PE-9	320-2930-257-010	<u>Carolyn Noble</u> Same	29,800	21,334	21,334	-	Postpone – Ammel, Neumeier, Carried More info needed
Pe-10	100-2931-208-014	<u>Becky Krause</u> Same	62,400	55,452	27,726	(27,726)	50% approved – Schroeder, Carried
	Subtotal		370,200	323,602	104,160	(219,442)	

3. Other Corrections

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

Clerical Error

	Parcel ID	<u>Owner</u>	2023 SEV	2023 Taxable	2023 Revised Taxable	Net Change	Reason
OC-1	490-2825-278-001	Dial	578,900	578,903	578,903	-	Pearson, Ammel, Carried AV MUST EQUAL FROZEN
OC-2	490-2930-333-004	Bay De Noc Development	62,600	62,578	62,578	-	Pearson, Schroeder, Carried AV MUST EQUAL FROZEN
OC-3	430-0000-200-600	McCoy Construction & Forestry	59,500	59,500	63,000	(3,500)	Ammel, Schroeder, Carried ACCEPT PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT AS SUBMITTED
OC-4	430-0000-191-000	Reflections	1,300	1,300	1,300	-	Neumeier, Schroeder, Carried ACCEPT PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT AS SUBMITTED
OC-5	430-0000-298-500	Wisconsin Michigan Physicians	200	200	-	(200)	Neumeier, Ammel, Carried ACCEPT PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT AS SUBMITTED
		Subtotal	702,500	702,481	705,781	(3,700)	

The Board heard the following protests and set new assessments:

	NAME	PARCEL NUMBER	PROPOSED 2023 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW ASSESSMENT
23-001	Donald LeMire 2435 Lake Shore Drive	051-210-3606-183-010	187,200	Schroeder, Neumeier, Carried No Change
23-002	Christopher Vanevera 900 South 17 th Street	051-330-3606-127-011	82,300	Schroeder, Neumeier, Carried 77,500 SEV

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

23-003	Rick and Lori LaMarch 1810 1 st Ave South	051-350-2930-331-011	121,300	Pearson, Neumeier, Carried 105,000 SEV 105,000 TAX
23-004	Eileen Kelly 2847 Lake Shore Dr.	051-220-3501-426-002	39,500	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried No Change 39,500 SEV 32,142 TAX

Mayor Ammel left meeting briefly at 9:35 a.m.

Mayor Ammel returned to the meeting at 10:10 a.m.

Hearing no further business before the Board of Equalization and Review and time being 4:00 p.m., the 2023 Board of Equalization and Review recessed until Wednesday, March 15, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

Wednesday Session

2:02 p.m.

March 15, 2023

Present: Mayor Ammel, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members Neumeier and Schroeder, City Assessor McNeil, Assistant Assessor Martin and City Clerk DeMay, Clerk of the Board.

Absent: None

3. Other Corrections

Clerical Error

	Parcel ID	Owner	2023 SEV	2023 Taxable	2023 Revised Taxable	Net Change	Reason
OC-6	430-0000-106-550	Edward Jones	4,600	4,600	-	(4,600)	Pearson, Schroeder, Carried CLASS CHANGE FROM 251 TO 003 REFERENCE
OC-7	430-0000-106-990	Edward Jones	3,200	3,200	-	(3,200)	Pearson, Schroeder, Carried CLASS CHANGE FROM 251 TO 003 REFERENCE
OC-8	430-0000-106-650	Edward Jones	2,100	2,100	-	(2,100)	Pearson, Schroeder, Carried CLASS CHANGE FROM 251 TO 003 REFERENCE
OC-9	430-0000-106-600	Edward Jones	2,000	2,000	-	(2,000)	Pearson, Schroeder, Carried CLASS CHANGE FROM 251 TO 003 REFERENCE
OC-10	430-0000-106-750	Edward Jones	6,800	6,800	21,200	14,400	Pearson, Schroeder, Carried ACCEPT PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT AS SUBMITTED
		Subtotal	\$721,200	\$721,200	\$726,981	\$5,800	

2023 Board of Equalization and Review - continued

The Board heard the following protests and set new assessments:

	NAME	PARCEL NUMBER	PROPOSED 2023 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW ASSESSMENT
23-005	Timothy Taylor 625 N. 18 Street	051-130-2930-126-014	32,700	Ammel, Pearson, Carried 22,500 SEV 22,500 TAX
23-006	Bay Bank 200 N. Lincoln Rd	051-120-2930-155-004	955,500	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried 865,300 SEV 865,300 TAX
23-007	Daniel and Margo Phalen 1720 21 st Road	051-250-3606-126-011	181,000	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried 170,000 SEV
23-008	Nina Suter 1026 S. Lincoln Rd	051-420-2836-200-042	54,400	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried No Change
23-009	Judith and Solomon Cohn 2019 Lake Shore Dr.	051-420-3606-200-005	175,700	Neumeier, Ammel, Carried No Change
23-010	Aaron Anderson 909 South 12 th	051-100-2931-237-006	96,600	Ammel, Neumeier, Carried 92,000 SEV 92,000 TAX

The time being 5:00 p.m. Neumeier moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, the Board of Equalization and Review recessed until 6:00 p.m.

The Board of Equalization and Review came back into open session at 6:00 p.m.

There being no further business or public comment to come before the 2023 Board of Equalization and Review, the Board adjourned at 9:00 p.m. until the call of the Chair.

Respectfully submitted,

Phil DeMay
City Clerk of the Board